

## Jonesfield Township Board Minutes

August 20, 2018

Supervisor Tibbits called the regular meeting of the Jonesfield Township Board to order at 7:00 pm.

PRESENT: Tibbits, Nock, Buckley, Parker and Stanley

ABSENT: None

GUESTS: See attached Sign-In Sheet plus, Richard Bluemer-Planning Commission Chairperson and Ryan Stockford-Saginaw County Deputy

PERMITS: Mechanical 11-18-J, Denome; Zoning 12-18-J, Bluemer; Electrical 11-18-J, Denome; Electrical 8-15-J, Shephard; Electrical 10-18-J, Zeitz; Electrical 9-18-J, Draves.

- I. Pledge of Allegiance
- II. Introduction of Topics – Supervisor Tibbits welcomed everyone to our board meeting and opened with comments regarding the main topic to be covered at the meeting and the steps as to how the meeting would be handled.
- III. Public Comments Limited to Three Minutes – 24 various residents and non-residents of Jonesfield Township made public comments regarding pending Wind Turbine Ordinance.
- IV. Additions to Agenda – Supervisor Tibbits asked that the Action Item concerning the Wind Ordinance be moved to Item VII b.
- V. Approval of Board Meeting minutes from July 16, 2018 - Motion made by Parker to accept minutes. Second by Nock with the edit to Action Item A – adding verbiage that Mike Keenan along with Richard Bluemer have agreed to accept another term on the Planning Committee. Carried.
- VI. Reports:
  - a) *Treasurer* – Treasurer Parker reported current balances as: General Fund - \$118,825.25, Trash Fund - \$59,013.73 and Police Fund - \$91,349.73.
  - b) *Police* – Deputy Ryan Stockford reported that they have been investigating break ins happening around the village area – NC Underground & Davis Auto. Have individual as a possible suspect.

c) *Reports from Commissions/Boards/Committees* – None.

*Planning Commission* – None

*Police Board* – Trustee Buckley announced that a meeting has been tentatively scheduled for September 10, 2018.

*Waste Authority* – None.

*SAGA(GIS)* – Meeting scheduled for next Monday

*Municipal Water* – None

## VII Discussion Items –

- a) A Special Use Permit Public Hearing will be held on Tuesday, August 28, 2018, 7:00 pm – Campers Choice RV and Repair from Freeland, Michigan requesting a Special Use Permit for the property located at 21925 Gratiot Rd, Merrill, Michigan.
- b) Planning Commission Wind Ordinance Approval Recommendation from August 2, 2018 – Planning Commission Chairperson Bluemer presented to the Board the finalized version of the Wind Energy Ordinance that the Planning Committee has completed. Since the May 2018 version, the only change has been to Section G, 1a – regarding setbacks from the Jonesfield Township Future Land Use Map. Chairperson Bluemer reviewed the other key points of the proposed ordinance. Questions asked by Trustee Buckley were answered by Chairperson Bluemer. Supervisor Tibbits made a statement regarding the presented ordinance – thanking the committee for their hard work and time put into the writing of the proposed ordinance. Supervisor Tibbits made a main motion that we approve the Planning Commission’s recommended Wind Ordinance from their August 2, 2018 meeting as currently updated with the modifications from that meeting and that this board lift the one-year moratorium on wind turbines and any other alternate energy resources put in place by this board during our October 23, 2017 board meeting. Parker seconded. Supervisor Tibbits explained the board would now debate the main motion and that during that debate up to two subsequent motions could be made, seconded and acted on. Trustee Buckley asked for discussion regarding the potential loss of revenue from the Senate Bill 1031 that is currently in the Michigan Legislature and he also had questions regarding setbacks from non-participating property owners. Trustee Buckley made a substitute motion to send the proposed ordinance back to the Planning Commission to review setbacks from non-participating property lines, which is currently at 499 ft. He said he would like it matched to the current setbacks for the Jonesfield Township Future Land Use Map which is 1400 ft. Supervisor Tibbits then asked for a second to Justin’s substitute motion. Hearing no second for the motion, the motion failed. Comments were made by Supervisor Tibbits regarding House and Senate bills being introduced in the legislature and Trustee Nock made comments responding to public comments regarding flicker and sound, explaining the research that was done regarding these items. At this time, Supervisor Tibbits asked for a roll call vote on the main motion. Clerk Stanley requested and received the following votes –

Parker – Yes  
Stanley – Yes  
Tibbits – Yes  
Nock – Yes  
Buckley – No

Motion carried.

Trustee Buckley cited concerns as follows: Based on the research I have conducted, the proposed wind ordinance is not complete. My main issue of concern is with the proposed setbacks for non-participating, non-inhabited areas being set at 1X turbine height from the property line. Based on what other townships have listed in their ordinance this distance needed to be reconsidered by the planning commission. A setback at 1X the turbine from a property line introduces a major public safety concern to township residents. There is potential in the event of a wind turbine failure the wind turbine could land on the property of someone that doesn't wish to have a wind turbine on their property. There is also potential for ice debris coming off one of the turbine blades to hit someone on a non-participating property causing injury at a 1X turbine height setback. One of my responsibilities as a member of the board is to look out for the safety and well-being of **ALL** our residents. In addition, all residents should have the same opportunity for future growth. The planning commission at their August 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting approved greater setbacks (1,400 ft) from boundary lines considered as Future Growth areas. There was no consideration for the future development of A-1 and A-2 areas that are currently not inhabited. Based on public comment there is very apparent resistance about the setback being proposed. The wind turbine ordinance as it is worded today opens Jonesfield township to future litigation. Therefore, I strongly discourage voting to approve the wind turbine ordinance as it is worded currently.

In addition to concerns about the proposed ordinance I also have great concerns about the financial benefit a wind turbine farm will provide for the township. There is no financial guarantee Jonesfield Township will see the tax revenue projected by Saginaw Future. There is a strong possibility based on current legislature any wind farm installed after 12/31/2017 would be exempt from Personal Property taxes. I do not support the rest of the board's view on this topic. There are too many unknowns, red flags, and resident opposition to not stop and investigate this topic in more detail before proceeding forward with this wind turbine ordinance as written.

- c) A Joint Fire Board Meeting and Fire District Budget Approval will be held on Monday, September 10, 2018 at 7:00 pm at the Jonesfield Lakefield Fire Hall in Merrill.
- d) Election Results, Precinct Report and Next Steps – Clerk Stanley stated the August primary election went smoothly except for the glitch at the end of the day with transmitting results. This resulted in using the back up plan of deputizing Supervisor Tibbits to transport memory cards to drop off location. Road millage failed by only 10 votes.
- e) Possible September 17, 2018 Board Meeting Change of Date – Due to conflict with this date for Trustee Buckley, it was discussed to change the date of the Board Meeting to

the following week, Monday, September 24<sup>th</sup> @ 7:00 pm. Everyone was in agreement with this change. Date change will be posted on public notifications.

- f) Long Term Folding Chair Replacement Proposal – Discussion was made regarding some broken chairs that we have. We currently advertise in our hall rental agreement that we have seating for up to 400, so we are going to need to investigate replacing approximately 12 chairs for now. Supervisor Tibbits will check into pricing of chairs that may be of a stronger construction and possibly have the chairs last longer. Will bring back information to our September meeting.
- g) Air Conditioning Replacement and Planning for Remaining Two Furnaces – Discussion was made on replacement of the failed Air Conditioning Unit we have for the hall. Verbal estimate from Dennis Richnak was approximately \$3,000. Also need to get estimates on the other two failing furnaces. Suggestions were made to get estimates from Dennis Richnak and Bob Fries on both the air conditioning units and furnaces. Supervisor Tibbits will present back to the board when he has those estimates. The leaking of the roof on the day of our election was also discussed. It was agreed that we should have a contractor look at the roof and make suggestions of what needs to be done. Clerk Stanley will research the name of the last contractor used to make repairs to the roof.
- h) Roundtable for the good of the Township – Discussion was made of the talk that has been heard in township regarding roads that have been chipped and sealed even though road millage did not pass. A couple of miles of local roads in the township have been done and paid for 100% by the Saginaw County Road Commission.

VIII. Action Items:

- a) Reappointment of David Doehring to Police Board – It was announced by Trustee Buckley that he has been in contact with David and he is not interested in renewing his term on the police board. David did make suggestion of contacting Jay Riesma for possible interest in the position. Suggestion was made to also contact Mark Gath. Mark has made comments in the past of being interested in participating on a committee. An opening notice will be posted on the township website, [www.jonesfield.com](http://www.jonesfield.com), with interested parties to contact Trustee Buckley.
- b) Motion to Pay Bills – General Fund - \$11,742.53, Police Fund - \$24,784.93 and Trash Fund - \$3,987.11. Motion made by Parker to pay bills. Second by Tibbits. Carried.
- c) Other – None.

IX. Extended Public Comment:

- David Hutfilz suggested checking into the Richland Township Police and see how they handle their policing. Also asked about the effective date on the Wind Ordinance and where to find different items on the township website. Made suggestion to make more user friendly.

- Rochelle Siler made comments again regarding the Wind Ordinance and the errors, she feels, in the setbacks and not having a specific footage listed in ordinance instead of just 1x height and the concerns she has over the possible loss of revenue from the turbines.
- David Hutfilz was in agreeance with Rochelle's comments.
- Ron Garrett – Ingersoll Township – Commended Planning Committee on the time spent and the way the ordinance was written.
- Justin Buckley made comments regarding caution to the verbiage regarding setbacks.
- 

X. Next Meeting: Monday, September 24, 2018 @ 7:00 pm

XI. Adjournment - Motion made by Clerk Stanley to adjourn meeting at 9:55 pm. Second by Supervisor Tibbits. Carried.

Signed,

---

Marcia J Stanley – Jonesfield Township Clerk